

Peer Review for Essay #3 (Argumentative)

Remember that your goal isn't to answer "yes" to every question: it's to make suggestions. Try using "Consider ____" or "Try ____" to preface your comments.

1. Introduction

- a. What changes could be made to help the intro grab your attention?
- b. Does it provide enough background information to set up the issue? Do you understand the topic? Are two or more paragraphs needed to provide information?
- c. Is the background material cited?

2. Thesis

Copy out what you think is the thesis and division statement.

- a) Comment on its clarity
 - can you tell the position of the writer?
 - Are the divisions really distinct and separate, or could two of them be combined into one?

3. Support your position

For each paragraph complete the following:

a) Topic Sentences

- Does the topic sentence set up an argument based on the divisions?
- Is there a focus word which connects back to the division and thesis in the first sentence (or so)?

b) Definitions

- Do any terms from the topic sentence need to be defined? For instance, economic/social mobility; supply side economics; worker safety laws? etc.

c) Evidence/Details

- Where can more specific information from the readings to connect the division to _____(thesis) be included?

d) Explanation

- The #1 item that usually needs work is the explanation: where can a more specific explanation on why ____ (topic of paragraph) helps or hurts America be added?
- What kind of argumentative language is used to explain the logic behind the argument? Do they use any of the following:

The problem with ____ is that _____.

This _____ helps/hurts society/America/people because _____

The advantage/s/disadvantage/s of _____ is/are _____.

If ____ continues, then ____.

Where could they include such language?

- Where can more explanations – analogies to other events, reference to economic, social, political, moral arguments, etc. (see *I&C* 65) – be included? Remember that it is the explanation, not the evidence, that shows your reasoning.
- Ask yourself "How does this division prove the argument in the essay?" or "Why is this division important to the thesis?" Make suggestions based on these answers.

4. Counterargument and Rebuttal

- Where is an additional counterargument needed? Where is a clearer rebuttal needed?
- Do opposing views need to be treated separately at the end, or would they work better if included throughout the essay?
- Is the counter argument a specific argument or is it general?
- Is it cited?

5. Conclusion

Avoid merely repeating the thesis.

- Does the writer refer back to the introduction?
- Does the writer address the question "What's it all mean?"?